

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORP.,)	
NOVARTIS CORP., and NOVARTIS AG,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	Civil Action No: 2:06-cv-04125 (FSH)
v.)	
)	STIPULATIONS REGARDING
ROXANE LABORATORIES, INC.)	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS
)	
Defendant.)	
)	
NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORP.,)	
NOVARTIS CORP., and NOVARTIS AG,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	Civil Action No: 2:06-cv-04178 (FSH)
v.)	
)	STIPULATIONS REGARDING
TARO PHARMACEUTICALS U.S.A., INC. and)	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS
TARO PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRIES LTD.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	
)	
NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORP.,)	
NOVARTIS CORP., and NOVARTIS AG,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	Civil Action No: 2:06-cv-04199 (FSH)
v.)	
)	STIPULATIONS REGARDING
BRECKENRIDGE PHARMACEUTICAL, INC.)	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS
)	
Defendant.)	
)	
NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORP.,)	
NOVARTIS CORP., and NOVARTIS AG,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	Civil Action No: 2:06-cv-04200 (FSH)
v.)	
)	STIPULATIONS REGARDING
TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC.)	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS
)	
Defendant.)	
)	

STIPULATIONS REGARDING SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS

1. Whereas, Novartis asserts the secondary consideration of unexpected results in this case, but it does not assert, and commits not to rely on, any other objective indicium of non-obviousness in this case;

2. Whereas, defendants' document requests seek Novartis documents relating to unasserted secondary considerations and, e.g., "all" Novartis documents concerning the sales and marketing of "any" oxcarbazepine product;

3. Whereas, Novartis has represented to defendants that defendants' document requests call for the production of millions of pages of Novartis documents; and

4. Whereas, the parties have discussed, and have agreed to, a stipulation in lieu of the production of Novartis documents responsive to defendants' document requests;

NOW THEREFORE, the parties, through their counsel, hereby agree and stipulate as follows:

A. For purposes of this action only, there was no skepticism or doubt expressed about the subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

B. For purposes of this action only, there was no long-felt need met by any subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

C. For purposes of this action only, there was no commercial success of any product embodying any subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

D. For purposes of this action only, there was no failure of others to develop a product embodying any subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

E. For purposes of this action only, there were no awards, praise, recognition or honors received by Novartis concerning any subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

F. For purposes of this action only, there has been no teaching away from the subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

G. Nothing in the foregoing paragraphs A through F would preclude Novartis from presenting evidence relevant to its asserted unexpected results of color stability and avoidance of food effect attributable to the subject matter claimed in the '525 patent.

Dated: September 26, 2007

s/ Henry J. Renk

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Novartis
Pharmaceuticals Corporation,
Novartis Corporation and
Novartis AG

William O'Shaughnessy
Andrew T. Berry
Nicole Corona
McCARTER & ENGLISH
Four Gateway Center
100 Mulberry St.
Newark, New Jersey 07102
(973) 622-4444

Henry J. Renk
Nicholas N. Kallas
Tara A. Byrne
FITZPATRICK, CELLA, HARPER
& SCINTO
30 Rockefeller Plaza
New York, NY 10112-3801
(212) 218-2100

s/ Mark S. Olinsky

Attorneys for Defendant
Roxane Laboratories, Incorporated
Mark S. Olinsky
HoeChin Kim

SILLS CUMMIS
EPSTEIN & GROSS P.C.
One Riverfront Plaza
Newark, NJ 07102
(973) 643-7000

Marta E. Gross
Donny Vermut
Michael B. Cottler
(admitted *pro hac vice*)
GOODWIN PROCTER LLP
599 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10022
(212) 813-8800

Forrest A. Hainline III
Nicole E. Perrotton
(admitted *pro hac vice*)
GOODWIN PROCTER LLP
101 California Street, Suite 1850
San Francisco, CA 94111
(415) 733-6000

s/Paul H. Kochanski

Attorneys for Defendants Taro
Pharmaceuticals U.S.A., Inc. and
Taro Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.

Paul H. Kochanski (PK 0817)
Samantha Hanley
LERNER, DAVID, LITTBENBERG,
KRUMHOLZ & MENTLIK, LLP
600 South Avenue West
Westfield, NJ 07090-1497
Tel: 908.654.5000
Fax: 908.654.7866

/s C. Randolph Ross

Attorneys for Defendant
Breckenridge

Christopher C. Humphrey (CH 9551)
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL &
ROONEY, PC
550 Broad Street, Suite 810
Newark, NJ 07102-4582
Telephone: (973) 273-9800
Fax: (973) 273-9430

Of Counsel:
Charles R. Bruton
Teresa Stanek Rea
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL &
ROONEY, PC
1737 King Street Suite 500
Alexandria, VA 22314
Telephone: (703) 836-6620
Fax: (703) 836-2021

C. Randolph Ross
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL &
ROONEY, PC
1835 Market Street, 14th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103-2985
Telephone: (215) 665-8700
Fax: (215) 665-8760

s/ Jordan A. Sigale

Attorneys for Defendant
Teva Pharmaceuticals USA Inc

Jordan A. Sigale
Loeb & Loeb LLP
321 North Clark Street
Suite 2300
Chicago, IL 60610-4746

Allyn Z. Lite
Michael E. Patunas
LITE DEPALMA GREENBERG &
RIVAS, LLC
Two Gateway Center, 12th Floor
Newark, New Jersey 07102
Telephone: (973) 623-3000
Facsimile: (973) 623-0858